



**Eduard Franck: Orchestral Works II**

aud 20.034



Bayernkurier Nr. 36 (Wolfgang Johannes Müller - 2001.09.06)



**NEUER ROMANTIKER**

Ein Meister namens Eduard Franck

**NEUER ROMANTIKER**

Full review text restrained for copyright reasons.

CD Compact Num. 170, novembre 2003 (Josep Pascual - 2003.11.01)

Hace pocos meses, empezó a distribuirse entre nosotros un compacto del sello...

Full review text restrained for copyright reasons.

Crescendo 3/2000 (AC - 2001.04.01)



Das kleine, aber feine Detmolder Label Audite setzt seine Reihe mit Werken des...

Full review text restrained for copyright reasons.

**Das Orchester 05/2001 (Gerhard Anders - 2001.05.01)**

Eduard Franck hat Konjunktur. Ein halbes Dutzend CDs mit Werken dieses...

*Full review text restrained for copyright reasons.*

**Diapason Janvier 2005 (Jean-Claude Hulot - 2005.01.01)**

La firme Audite a entrepris de réhabiliter la musique d'Eduard Franck, romantique allemand qui fut l'élève particulier de Mendelssohn et qui jouissait de l'estime de Schumann. Son œuvre, très abondante mais en partie perdue, manifeste l'influence de son maître, illustrant l'esthétique de l'école de Leipzig. La violoniste Christiane Edinger figure parmi les maîtres d'œuvre de ces très généreux ensemble ; après le vaste Concerto n° 1 (cf n° 474, avec une autre symphonie), elle propose le second, marqué jusqu'au pastiche par celui de Beethoven, couplé avec une symphonie inspirée par Mendelssohn, notamment par l'« Italienne » ; belle lecture, malgré un orchestre sans brillant particulier, mais qui mérite la découverte. Franck a écrit un très vaste corpus de musique de chambre ; le Quatuor Edinger a gravé trois des quatre quatuors et le Quintette avec piano ; tout comme dans les deux sextuors, on trouve dans ces pages de coupe immuablement classique un style proche de la musique de chambre de Mendelssohn, ou fugitivement de Beethoven, plus que des partitions contemporaines de Brahms, Dvorak et Tchaikovski. Sans prétention novatrice, un bonheur mélodique incontestable, doublé d'une réelle élégance d'écriture innerve ces partitions. Le Quatuor Edinger, renforcé selon les œuvres, propose une lecture satisfaisante de ces premières mondiales, même si certains traits « mendelssohniens » de virtuosité apparaissent mal contrôlés, et si l'ensemble aurait gagné à plus de flamme – en particulier de dans les mouvements lents, parfois bien ternes ; néanmoins, il faut saluer une découverte intéressante, en conseillant de commencer par le disque qui réunir le Quatuor n°1 et le Quintette, à mon sens les deux partitions les plus convaincantes.

Les deux sonates pour violoncelle et piano sont de réelles réussites qui mettent en valeur le lyrisme flatteur de l'instrument, et qui mériteraient de revenir au répertoire ; l'éditeur leur associe celles de Richard Franck, fils d'Eduard et élève de Reinecke (lui-même successeur de Mendelssohn à Leipzig), également pianiste, compositeur et chef d'orchestre. Moins inspirées que celles de son père, elles n'en témoignent pas moins de la qualité « artisanale » du travail du fils Franck ; bonne idée d'avoir fait le lien par les Trois pièces, charmeuses et un peu salonnardes de Reinecke. Enfin, les deux trios avec piano de Richard sont également marqués par les influences de Mendelssohn, Schubert et Schumann, avec les mêmes écriture et invention mélodique que son père, quoique encore plus anachronique (1893 et 1900) ; les deux sonates pour violon et piano (1890 et 1903) sont tout autant charmeuses, illustrant avec bonheur la facture de cette « musique de salon » comme la baptisait avec condescendance Max Reger. Au demeurant, bien défendues par les musiciens réunis pour ces disques, ces pages inédites ne manquent pas d'attrait et justifient qu'on sorte des sentiers battus pour aller à leur rencontre.

**Frankfurter Allgemeine Zeitung 17.08.2001 (Werner M. Grimmel - 2001.08.17)**

**Frankfurter Allgemeine**  
ZEITUNG FÜR DEUTSCHLAND

**Pflicht zur Romantik**

*Da ist Platz neben den Gipsbüsten: Eduard Franck hat ihn verdient*

Pflicht zur Romantik

*Full review text restrained for copyright reasons.*

**Klassik heute 3/01 (Benjamin G. Cohrs - 2001.03.01)**

**KLASSIK**  
**HEUTE**  
[www.klassik-heute.de](http://www.klassik-heute.de)

Diese CD macht einen noch besseren Eindruck als ihre ältere Schwester mit dem...

*Full review text restrained for copyright reasons.*

**Neue Musikzeitung 2/02, (Mátyás Kiss - 2002.05.01)**

**nmz**  
neue musikzeitung

Der in Breslau geborene Mendelssohn-Schüler Eduard Franck (1817-1893) hat Werke...

*Full review text restrained for copyright reasons.*

**Neue Musikzeitung Juli/August 2004 (Hanspeter Krellmann - 2004.07.01)**

**nmz**  
neue musikzeitung

**Schatten-Dasein – Komponisten, die aus dem Raster fallen**

Schatten-Dasein – Komponisten, die aus dem Raster fallen

*Full review text restrained for copyright reasons.*

www.amazon.co.uk 21 Jan 2009 (J. A. Peacock - 2009.01.21)

### More warm hearted orchestral works from Eduard Franck

Audite's previous disc of orchestral works – like this one, a violin concerto and a symphony – was a real winner, sympathetically recorded and performed. This follow up album is also a rewarding and interesting release.

The D major violin concerto strives for a loftier tone than the E minor work on the previous disc and while it may seem a little more impersonal in mood during the first movement, it still mines Franck's rich seam of melody and harmonic resource. Repeated listenings have shown that, like in his previous concerto, he is capable of stirring emotion without resource to gimmicks or flashiness. The second movement reflects the serious tone of the first movement, eschewing the variation format of the previous work in favour of an 'adagio molto espressivo' that one might expect from a Romantic concerto of this era; it is in a relatively uncomplicated ABA form, with the traditional 'dramatic' episode at the centre of the movement. For me, this central part misses fire somewhat, but I am willing to concede that it might sound differently with alternative performers – without knowledge of the score, it is difficult to ascertain whether the slightly stilted and awkward moments are a result of Edinger and the conductor or the composer himself; it might indeed be both; it is but a minor cavil, though. The finale is a rustic sounding dance, with an opening theme that initially threatens to turn into Bruch but immediately carries on to form an ingratiatingly memorable melody that lingers in the mind long after the piece has finished.

My partner feels that Edinger, in this and the E minor concerto on Audite's other disc, is a little over-emphatic as a performer at times, to the detriment of Franck's music; for myself, although I can see how a more historically aware performance might also reap dividends, I am generally quite happy with her warmth and rich emotion. It is a matter of taste therefore and I would have room in my collection for both this and an alternate performance on 'authentic' instruments should any adventurous period band decide to take up the scores.

I awarded the previous disc an unequivocal five stars, but this disc I have given four stars only. This is because I don't feel the symphony in B flat is as well balanced or distinctive as its A major counterpart. Although contemporary critics had reservations about the slow movement and finale, I feel it is the two outer movements that let the work down.

The first movement is as one expects from Franck the symphonist, a relatively untroubled and flowing piece, the development section moving along quite naturally and elegantly – indeed the whole movement has an easy grace about it and is finely orchestrated. The problem is that the material lacks a certain definition and memorability.

The scherzo, a type of movement for which Franck seems to have had a definite flair, certainly doesn't disappoint; and while the slow movement cries out for a strong melody to really pull it together, it has no lack of atmosphere, at times the twilight shades becoming quite dark. It is a shame that it is followed by an amiable but not particularly memorable finale and one which is far too short and inconsequential to round off a symphony from this period, even a conservative and modest one.

The result then is a fine concerto and a pleasant, curate's egg of a symphony. Given that the minor keys produced some of the composer's most interesting chamber music, it is lamentable that the two early minor key symphonies appear to have disappeared without a trace – we can only hope that copies of the manuscripts or parts turn up somewhere so that Audite can continue with their enterprising and valuable service to this neglected composer.

www.amazon.co.uk 1 Jan 2013 (Michael Gilchrist - 2013.01.01)



### More Romantic era gems

Amazon has facilitated an endless journey of discovery for the classical music enthusiast wanting to move beyond the well trodden paths of Mozart, Beethoven, Schubert, Brahms, Tchaikovsky, etc. These and other giants of the 18th and 19th centuries had a host of lesser or unknown contemporaries composing works not far short of the established masterpieces. Specialist labels like cpo, Chandos and Naxos have opened the doors to numerous composers I hadn't heard of. After I came across the Sterling label and bought up much of its catalogue including a very appealing album of Richard Franck's orchestral works. I then learned that Richard's father Eduard was also an accomplished composer and the very favourable Amazon reviews prompted me to purchase the three releases on the audite label of his symphonies, violin concertos and orchestral items, including the present one. The music is invariably tuneful and beautifully orchestrated, performed and recorded. Anyone who enjoys Mendelssohn and his contemporaries should try Franck's works. I would rate the present CD and the other audite releases as among my more successful discoveries along with Czerny, Wilms, Kalliwoda, Gouvy, Onslow and other lesser known 19th century composers.

www.amazon.com March 17, 2004 (Paul Grainger - 2004.03.17)



### Unknown greatness

Having purchased the first volume of Eduard Franck's orchestral works, the violin concerto opus 30, and the Symphony opus 47 and really loved those I naturally had to buy the second volume of Eduard Franck's orchestral works. That these are not only first recordings but first performances (according to the notes) is totally unbelievable. If you like Mendelssohn, Schuman and Brahms these are for you. Eduard Franck is no place imitator but truly excellent original composer of the 19th Century German Romantic school.

Beautifully recorded and played these are like the first CD, essential for any complete classical CD collection.

www.amazon.com July 4, 2012 (G.D. - 2012.07.04)



### Rewarding music in very fine performances

Eduard Franck (1817-1893) was a German composer of some note in his day (no relation to Cesar Franck), and on the evidence of the music here, a rather unfairly neglected one. Fortunately Audite has done an impressive job of recording his music. The violin concerto in D major op. 57 was composed in 1860 and is apparently his second work in the genre. It is an ambitious, inventive and thoroughly engaging work; it may not be the most stylistically original concerto composed in the Romantic era, but Franck's writing for the instrument (and the orchestra) is impressive and much of the music here is deeply rewarding and even memorable. The first movement appears to be very influenced by Beethoven, but Franck clearly knew how to live up to the ambitious scheme. The somewhat Brahmsian slow movement, on the other hand, is a

masterpiece on its own – the kind that will haunt the listener for a long time afterwards. The finale is delightful, if light, with plenty of fiery fireworks in the solo part. Overall, this is a magnificent work that would surely warrant a life in the concert hall.

The symphony in B major op. 52 dates from 1856 and is, apparently, Franck's second or third (it is a little unclear, and not all of his works in the genre seems to have survived). Although it may not be quite in the league of the violin concerto it is still an impressive work, this time clearly inhabiting the sound world of Schumann though with a certain personal streak – the composer that my mind was most frequently drawn toward was Robert Volkmann. It is a confident, often atmospheric work; the thematic material is generally strong and Franck certainly knew what to do with it – the format is taut and the argument cogent.

Two easily recommended works, then, and particular praise should go to the violin concerto. The performances by the Saarbrücken Radio Symphony Orchestra under Hans-Peter Frank may not exhibit the last touch of finesse, but they are far more than merely serviceable, conjuring up plenty of spirit, color, panache and exuberance. Christiane Edinger produces affectionate playing in the concerto, and while some details may be a little fuzzy her ability to sustain a singing line is consistently impressive, in particular in the second movement. Overall, this is a very rewarding release, recommended with some enthusiasm.

**www.ClassicsToday.com February 2004 (Victor Carr Jr - 2004.02.01)**



Christiane Edinger takes to the part with relish, claiming a respectable place for Franck's concerto in the repertoire. [...] A major factor in this impression undoubtedly is the care, commitment, and professionalism exhibited by Hans-Peter Frank and the Saarbrücken Radio Symphony, who make a convincing case for both of these rare pieces. Audite captures it all in pleasingly spacious, naturally balanced sound.

*Full review text restrained for copyright reasons.*

**www.musicweb-international.com 01.11.2003, (Rob Barnett - 2003.11.01)**



In the first two of three movements of the Violin Concerto Franck is clearly doffing his hat to the Olympian heights of Beethoven's Violin Concerto and perhaps to the slow movement of the Brahms. In the allegro finale the writing is more flamboyant but aiming to delight rather in the dance floor sense of the Op. 49 quartet's finale. There is no hint of 'moving the earth' with dramatic gesture. The compass is primed by the Beethoven Romances and Violin Concerto.

The B flat major symphony confidently inhabits the world of the Schumann Second Symphony and the Mendelssohn Scotch. However along the way we have excursions into snowy soliloquies (Tchaikovsky's Winter Daydreams came to mind). Franck sometimes summons up impressively Brucknerian concentration with horn ornamentation to match. The open-air manner of Lange-Müller and of Schumann's First Symphony is well carried off.

It is pleasing that this estimable symphony survived unlike the well received A Minor and G Minor symphonies from 1846 and 1852 respectively. Perhaps you know otherwise ... let me know.

Eduard Franck had two brothers one of whom was also a composer. Richard Franck's cello sonatas can be heard on two other Audite CDs (20021 and 20031) coupled, in each case, with cello sonatas by Eduard.

If you like your Schumann and Mendelssohn this CD is certainly for you. Performances are remarkably well despatched. You will have little to complain of and Hans-Peter Frank makes hay with the many invitations to joyous exuberance that Franck has left throughout these scores.

**www.new-classics.co.uk January 2005 ( - 2005.01.01)**

**new classics**

The excellent Christiane Edinger (violin) gives a first-rate performance in this premiere recording of the Violin Concerto in D by Eduard Franck. Also included on this admirable CD is Franck's fine Symphony in B flat major. The Rundfunk-Sinfonieorchester Saarbrücken is conducted by Hans-Peter Frank.

**Inhaltsverzeichnis**

Bayernkurier Nr. 36..... 1  
 CD Compact Num. 170, novembre 2003..... 1  
 Crescendo 3/2000..... 1  
 Das Orchester 05/2001..... 2  
 Diapason Janvier 2005..... 2  
 Frankfurter Allgemeine Zeitung 17.08.2001..... 3  
 Klassik heute 3/01..... 3  
 Neue Musikzeitung 2/02,..... 3  
 Neue Musikzeitung Juli/August 2004..... 3  
 www.amazon.co.uk 21 Jan 2009..... 4  
 www.amazon.co.uk 1 Jan 2013..... 5  
 www.amazon.com March 17, 2004..... 5  
 www.amazon.com July 4, 2012..... 5  
 www.ClassicsToday.com February 2004..... 6  
 www.musicweb-international.com 01.11.2003,..... 6  
 www.new-classics.co.uk January 2005..... 7