These are all arrangements. The arrangement of the Second Symphony was perhaps by Beethoven himself (but perhaps, as the Audite liner notes point out, by Ferdinand Ries). The Trio in E-flat was arranged from the String Quintet, Op. 4 and published as Op. 63. The piano concerto was arranged for piano and string quintet well after Beethoven’s time by Vincenz Lachner and published in 1881. Both of these releases are parts of larger series. The Shybayeva is the second of three that will include all five concertos in Lachner’s versions with string quintet (the symphony is a filler), and the Swiss disc is the seventh and last in their survey of the Beethoven trios. In fact I reviewed the first volume from the Swiss Trio (J/A 2015).

Back in 2015 I was particularly impressed with the pianism of Martin Lucas Staub; he was assertive and articulate, but never heavy. That judgement seems just as valid today as then, and with his partners violinist Angela Golubeva and cellist Joel Marosi (who has replaced Sebastian Singer) they play wonderful chamber music. I make this rather banal point because in the other recording I get a sense of a free-for-all, rather than a group of good friends getting together to make music. Hanna Shybayeva is a wonderful pianist, but she tears at the Second Symphony, trying, it would seem, to make the chamber version superior to the original. Strings from the Animato Quartet—violinist Floor Le Coultre and cellist Pieter de Koe—are fully on board with this all-out approach. Tempos are all faster than with the Swiss, and the music is undeniably exciting. Only in the slow movement did I feel the need for more repose.

The other pieces are fine as well. The Trio in E-flat is a nice, interesting piece, and somehow just as enjoyable as the original version (an early work for string quintet). On the other disc Shybayeva plays Beethoven’s First Concerto, and again it is quick and exciting, with a long challenging cadenza in I. The accompaniment from the Animato Quartet plus bass is satisfactory if your attention is mainly on the pianist, but sometimes the addition of bass made the music bottom-heavy. So we have two discs, both looking at Beethoven through the medium of arrangement. I endorse both, but you will have to judge whether you want these scaled-down versions rather than the real thing.
BEETHOVEN: Symphony 2
with Piano Concerto 1
Hanna Shybayeva, Animato Quartet; Bas Vliegenthart, db—Naxos 551431—70 minutes

with Trio in E-flat
Swiss Piano Trio—Audite 97.771—65 minutes

These are all arrangements. The arrangement of the Second Symphony was perhaps by Beethoven himself (but perhaps, as the Audite liner notes point out, by Ferdinand Ries). The Trio in E-flat was arranged from the String Quintet, Op. 4 and published as Op. 63. The piano concerto was arranged for piano and string quintet well after Beethoven’s time by Vincenzo Lachner and published in 1881. Both of these releases are parts of larger series. The Shybayeva is the second of three that will include all five concertos in Lachner’s versions with string quintet (the symphony is a filler), and the Swiss disc is the seventh and last in their survey of the Beethoven trios. In fact I reviewed the first volume from the Swiss Trio (I/A 2015).

Back in 2015 I was particularly impressed with the pianism of Martin Lucas Staub; he was assertive and articulate, but never heavy. That judgement seems just as valid today as then, and with his partner violinist Angela Golubeva and cellist Joel Marosi (who has replaced Sebastian Singer) they play wonderful chamber music. I make this rather bald point because in the other recording I get a sense of a free-for-all, rather than a group of good friends getting together to make music. Hanna Shybayeva is a wonderful pianist, but she tears at the Second Symphony, trying, it would seem, to make the chamber version superior to the original. Strings from the Animato Quartet—violinist Floor Le Coultre and cellist Pieter de Koe—are fully on board with this all-out approach. Tempos are all faster than with the Swiss, and the music is undeniably exciting. Only in the slow movement did I feel the need for more repose.

The other pieces are fine as well. The Trio in E-flat is a nice, interesting piece, and somehow just as enjoyable as the original version (an early work for string quintet). On the other disc Shybayeva plays Beethoven’s First Concerto, and again it is quick and exciting, with a long challenging cadenza in I. The accompaniment from the Animato Quartet plus bass is satisfactory if your attention is mainly on the pianist, but sometimes the addition of bass made the music bottom-heavy.

So we have two discs, both looking at Beethoven through the medium of arrangement. I endorse both, but you will have to judge whether you want these scaled-down versions rather than the real thing.

ALTHOUGH